Disability Advisory Committee (DAC)

Meeting Minutes Summary

June 23, 2015

At end:

Public comments were received from

* Bill Mulligan, who offered thanks to the DAC for its work
* Shane Dundos
  + VRS 911 through apps, inclusion of the blind community
  + SOA
  + Captions and video description accessibility for the deaf blind community – FCC noted the need for rulemaking on this issue (C Vogler has videos how it works)
* Michelle \_\_\_\_ (CPADO)
  + Possible roundtable on the ability of deaf people with CP to access 911 and other services
  + Assured that this is in the works

Support for a revised SOA

25 yeah

7 abstentions

0 opposed

Abstensions on relay issue

Matt Gerst (CTIA); Alex Reynolds (CEA); Josh Pila (NAB); Diane Burstein (NCTA); Ann Marie Rohaly (TIA); Jeff Kramer (Verizon); Helena Mitchell (Wireless RERC).

Introductory remarks were provided by the following individuals: Kris Monteith, Commission Acting Chief of Consumer and Governmental Affairs Bureau (CGB); Karen Peltz Strauss, Deputy Chief of the CGB; Gregory Hlibok, Chief of the CGB Disability Rights Office; Elaine E. Gardner, DAC Designated Federal Officer (DFO); and Andrew Phillips, DAC Chair. The DAC members then introduced themselves; the names of the attending members are listed in Appendix A. The agenda is attached as Appendix B.

Paula Silberthau, an attorney with the Commission’s Office of General Counsel, provided an overview of the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA) and protocols for the DAC as a newly founded Federal advisory committee. For any further questions, contact Elaine Gardner, as the DAC DFO, at [dac@fcc.gov](mailto:dac@fcc.gov).

Elaine Gardner, DAC DFO, provided an overview of DAC, and its new website, [www.fcc.gpv/disability-advisory-committee](http://www.fcc.gpv/disability-advisory-committee), where many supporting documents may be found. Karen Peltz Strauss welcomed attendees. She noted that many extremely qualified people applied, and that the contributions of those who are serving on subcommittees are just as valued as those serving on the full DAC.

Commissioner O’Rielly provided welcoming remarks to thank the group for their service, noting that their work “can be an amazing equalizer in today’s society.” The Commissioner highlighted the need for the DAC to review issues within the context of the entire communications sphere; hence the need to consider the ultimate cost to the American consumer of any recommendation. He also stressed that DAC members must understand the Commission’s past work and rules, and its limitations on jurisdiction, and urged members not to underestimate the benefits of incremental improvements to users.

The meeting paused at 11:45 AM for lunch and four subcommittee meetings.

DAC reconvened at 3:45 PM to share the top three priorities of each subcommittee, as follows:

* Relay/Equipment Distribution Subcommittee co-chaired by Brenda Kelly-Frey and Angela Officer (absent), and facilitated by FCC staff Caitlin Vogus and Gregory Hlibok.

1. Recommendations for improvements in technology with considerations of interoperability, reliability, quality, and use of off-the-shelf equipment.
2. Recommendations for quality of service needs (including research into the human factors such as usage, demographics, and also quality needs for different relay services).
3. Recommendations for equipment availability and training.

* Communications Subcommittee co-chaired by Susan Mazrui and Mark Richert, and facilitated by FCC staff Rosaline Crawford and Eliot Greenwald.
  1. Data – learning more about consumers with disabilities, the technologies they use and the technologies they need, to increase consumer engagement and adoption
  2. Cross-agency Leadership – exploring how the FCC can build and strengthen connections with other federal agencies that are engaged in communications and technology-related activities.
  3. Interoperability – ensuring that converging and emerging technologies have the underlying structure they need to be interoperable.
* Video Programming Subcommittee co-chaired by Lise Hamlin and Thomas Wlodkowski, and facilitated by FCC staff Suzy Rosen Singleton and Rosaline Crawford.
  1. Identify priorities and recommendations for captioning.
  2. Identify priorities and recommendations for audio described programming.
  3. Education and awareness:  review best practices, evaluate the exchange of information among manufacturers, consumers and industry, and encourage consultation of people with disabilities in the development of products.
* Emergency Communications Committee co-chaired by Toni Dunne and Richard Ray, and facilitated by FCC staff Cheryl King and Suzy Rosen Singleton (who was facilitating a concurrent meeting.)
  1. Identify gaps: evaluate existing recommendations from similar committees, and the status and needs of any new or proposed standards.
  2. NG 911: explore interoperability, video 911, N-11 number accessibility, and Media Communication Line Services (MCLS).
  3. Emergency alerting:  Wireless Emergency Alerts (WEAs) should be increased to 180 characters, as recommended by the CSRIC Working Group, and be mandatory. Emergency Alert System (EAS) accessibility issues should be reviewed for comment.

Consensus was reached that the next meeting’s agenda would include a brief overview of the relevant work and rules of the FCC by FCC staff, perhaps for the past two years. This will assist DAC members in their task to identify gaps and provide recommendations.

Public Comments.

* Deana (Dee) Boeau, from Sarasota, Florida, expressed concern about captioning quality being thwarted by cut rate captioning contracts in the area. She was advised that the captioning quality rules go into effect on March 16, 2015.
* Jeremy Jacks, Vice President of CAGG, commended the FCC and the DAC for their work, and encouraged them to continue to consult with the industry and experts in formulating recommendations.
* Mark Hill, Cerebral Palsy and Deaf Organization, encouraged the DAC to address the issue of dual relay services and highlighted the importance of outreach.
* Dana Mulvaney encouraged the creation of a mechanism that allows for public input from stakeholders about issues relevant to the work of the DAC.
* Diane Schou recommended that as the DAC considers technologies, it consider both the positive and negatives, and be aware that a growing number of people are sensitive to or harmed by electromagnetic radiation.

The DAC Chair announced the future meeting dates: Tuesday, June 23, 2015, and Thursday, October 8, 2015. The DAC Chair further thanked CTIA and Matt Gerst for the generous sponsorship of the breakfast and lunch for the DAC. Meeting was adjourned.

Appendix A

Disability Advisory Committee Members and Subcommittee Members in Attendance

March 17, 2015

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Last Name** | **First Name** | **Organization Represented** |
| Bacon | Everette | National Federation of the Blind |
| Bahar | David | Communication Services for the Deaf (CSD) |
| Bailey (alternate) | Bruce | U.S. Access Board |
| Bell (alternate) | Avonne | Telecommunications Industry Association (TIA) |
| Bibler | Ron | Consumer |
| Bobeck (alternate) | Ann | National Association of Broadcasters |
| Bridges | Eric | American Council of the Blind (ACB) |
| Brooks (alternate) | Marcia | Perkins School for the Blind |
| Cooke | Kari | National Black Deaf Advocates |
| Creagan | Timothy P. | U.S. Access Board |
| Delts | Dillard | Consumer |
| Dunne | Toni | Intrado, Inc. |
| Finkel | Adam | National Court Reporters Association (NCRA) |
| Fletcher (alternate) | Mark | Avaya, Inc. |
| Forstall | James | TEDPA |
| Gerst | Matthew | CTIA - the Wireless Association |
| Goldberg | Larry | Yahoo! |
| Guinivan (alternate) | Phyllis | Center for Disability Studies, CEHD |
| Hamlin | Lise | Hearing Loss Association of America |
| Holmes | Pamela | Ultratec |
| Joehl | Sam | SSB BART Group |
| Jones | Gay | U.S. Department of Homeland Security |
| Kelley | Scott | LG Electronics |
| Kelly-Frey | Brenda | NASRA |
| Knife | Lee | Digital Media Assocation (DiMA) |
| Kramer | Jeff | Verizon |
| LaManna (alternate) | Eva | American Association of People with Disabilities (AAPD) |
| Luckett (alternate) | Jill | National Cable & Telecommunications Association (NCTA) |
| Maddix | Michael | Sorenson Communications |
| Martinez | Eddie | Columbia Lighthouse for the Blind |
| Mazrui | Susan | AT&T Services, Inc. |
| Michaelis | Paul | Avaya, Inc. |
| Mitchell | Helena | Wireless RERC |
| Nygren | Maggie | AAID |
| Parkins (alternate) | Jerry | Comcast Cable |
| Pearson | Robert | Accessible Media, Inc. |
| Phillips | Andrew | National Association of the Deaf |
| Pila | Joshua | National Association of Broadcasters (NAB) |
| Podey (alternate) | Stephanie | National Cable & Telecommunications Association (NCTA) |
| Rafi | Abe | The Arc |
| Ray | Richard | City of Los Angeles |
| Reynolds | Alexander | Consumer Electronics Association (CEA) |
| Richert | Mark | American Foundation for the Blind (AFB) |
| Roberts | Sharaine | Caption First, Inc. |
| Robertson | Scott Michael | Consumer |
| Rohaly | Ann Marie | TIA |
| Runnels | Lydia | ZVRS |
| Schafer | Julie | Registry of Interpreters for the Deaf (RID) |
| Sonnenstrahl | Al | Deaf Seniors of America |
| Stout | Claude | TDI, Inc. |
| Tan (alternate) | Jamie | AT&T Services, Inc. |
| Thompson | Hannah | Consumer |
| Tobias | Jim | Inclusive Technologies |
| Tua-Tupuola | Tafaimameo | American Samoa Community College |
| Vogler | Christian | Gallaudet RERC |
| Wlodkowski | Thomas | Comcast Cable |
| York | Heather | VITAC |
| Yousuf | Mohammed | U.S. Department of Transportation |
| Yunashko | Bryen | Helen Keller National Center |
| Ziegler | Dixie | Hamilton Relay |

FCC Employees:

Crawford, Rosaline

Gardner, Elaine

Greenwald, Eliot

Hlibok, Greg

King, Cheryl

Monteith, Kris

Singleton, Suzy Rosen

Strauss, Karen Peltz

Vogus, Caitlin

Appendix B: Agenda

**Federal Communications Commission**

**Disability Advisory Committee (DAC)**

**March 17, 2015**

**Agenda**

8:30 a.m. Arrival; Meet and Greet

Commission Meeting Room Andrew Phillips and Elaine Gardner

9:00 a.m. Welcome and Introductions Office of Chairman Tom Wheeler

Kris Monteith, Acting Chief, Consumer and Governmental Affairs Bureau

Karen Peltz Strauss, Deputy Chief, Consumer and Governmental Affairs Bureau

Gregory Hlibok, Chief, Disability Rights Office

9:20 a.m. Introduction of DAC members

11:00 a.m. Overview of DAC Elaine Gardner

Overview of Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA) Paula Silberthau

Overview of Subcommittees Andrew Phillips

11:35 Welcome by Commissioner Michael O’Rielly

11:45 a.m. Lunch Break

12:45 p.m. Subcommittee Meetings (Open to Subcommittee Members Only)

Relay/Equipment Distribution Subcommittee Facilitator: Caitlin Vogus

Commission Meeting Room

Communications Subcommittee Facilitator: Rosaline Crawford

Rooms TW-A402/TW-A442

2:00 p.m. Break

2:15 p.m. Video Programming Subcommittee Facilitator: Suzy Rosen Singleton

Commission Meeting Room

Emergency Subcommittee Facilitator: Cheryl King

Rooms TW-A402/TW-A442

3:30 p.m. Break

3:45 p.m. Reconvene DAC Meeting Andrew Phillips

Review Subcommittee Activities

4:30 p.m. Public Participation

4:50 p.m. Closing Remarks and Next Meeting Date

5:00 p.m. Adjournment