

Disability Advisory Committee (DAC)

Meeting Minutes

December 6, 2016

*Certified by Susan Mazrui and Claude Stout January 25, 2017*

The DAC December 6, 2016 meeting was opened by co-chairs Susan Mazrui of AT&T, and Claude Stout of Telecommunications for the Deaf and Hard of Hearing, Inc., who called for a roll call of those members present. Karen Peltz Strauss, Deputy Chief of the Commission's Consumer and Governmental Affairs Bureau, updated the group on the upcoming Commission agenda item on Real-Time Text, confirmed the Commission's reauthorization of the Disability Advisory Committee, and reported on the Commission's recent Direct Video Calling Showcase. She also introduced a new Disability Rights Office staff member, Will Schell.

FCC staff provided an update of significant Commission action relevant to the DAC since the September 22, 2016 DAC meeting. Suzanne Rosen Singleton, Chief of the Disability Rights Office, discussed the granting of a joint request by the National Association of Broadcasters, the American Council of the Blind and the American Federation of the Blind to extend an existing waiver of the requirement for broadcasters to aurally describe non-textual emergency information. She also remarked upon potential improvements in emergency alert accessibility, and potential improvements in Wireless Emergency Alert accessibility. Rosaline Crawford of the Disability Rights Office announced the release of the 2016 CVAA Biennial Report to Congress and the granting of a waiver to the Entertainment Software Association (ESA). The waiver relieves videogame software from the FCC's accessibility requirements for its advanced communications services. Elaine Gardner of the Disability Rights Office announced the release of a white paper titled Individuals with Cognitive Disabilities: Barriers to and Solutions for Accessible Information and Communication Technologies. Will Schell of the Disability Rights Office reminded the DAC that the user interface rules for accessible set-top boxes goes into effect on December 20, 2016.

Zainab Alkebsi of the National Association of the Deaf, and Chair of the DAC Technology Transitions Subcommittee, next gave a report on that subcommittee's activities, and read the subcommittee's recommendation to the DAC on the accessibility of the Internet of Things. After discussion, a motion was made and seconded to adopt the subcommittee's recommendation. The motion was passed, and the recommendation was adopted by the DAC.

Matthew Gerst of CTIA read a statement from Richard Ray thanking the DAC and providing an update to his previous statements about iOS's ability to use TTY to communicate with 911. Mr. Gerst then gave a report on the Emergency Communications Subcommittee's activities and how the Wireless Emergency Alert's enhancements assist people with disabilities. The report was followed by discussion regarding wireless 911 calls.

Lise Hamlin of Hearing Loss Association of America, Co-Chair of the DAC Video Programming Subcommittee and Chair of the Subcommittee's Captioning Working Group, next gave a report on her working group's activities. Thomas Wlodkowski of Comcast, Co-Chair of the DAC Video Programming Subcommittee and Chair of its Video Description Working Group, followed with a report on his working group's efforts to improve video descriptions identification in TV listings and allowing for easier activation of video description.

Next, Mark Richert of the American Foundation for the Blind and Co-Chair of the Communications Subcommittee, gave a report on that subcommittee's activities and provided suggestions for the next DAC to consider.

After a break for lunch, Marcia Brooks, of the Perkins School for the Blind and Co-Chair of the DAC Relay and Equipment Distribution Subcommittee, reported on her subcommittee's activities. She first read the subcommittee's suggestions for the next DAC to consider. Then Ms. Brooks read the subcommittee's recommendation on faster porting of phone numbers for users of telecommunications relay services. After discussion, a motion to adopt the recommendation with an amendment was made and passed. Next, Ms. Brooks read the subcommittee's recommendation for improved videomail to text for deaf-blind consumers. Finally, Ms. Brooks read the subcommittee's recommendation for improved pairing options (wireless or hardwired) of braille displays to mobile phones. Both recommendations were withdrawn for further consideration, and not voted on.

Larry Goldberg from Yahoo began a presentation on the future of television and answered questions. FCC Commissioner Jessica Rosenworcel addressed the DAC, and spoke of the importance of its work. Following her remarks, Phil McLachlan from EEG completed the presentation on the future of television with a discussion and demonstration of untethered captions. Discussion followed.

Marcia Brooks, of the Perkins School for the Blind and Co-Chair of the DAC Relay and Equipment Distribution Subcommittee announced that the subcommittee has revised their recommendation for improved videomail to text for deaf-blind consumers. After a reading of the amended recommendation, a vote was held and the recommendation was adopted. .

The public comment period was opened. Public comments were heard regarding electromagnetic sensitivity from Kevin Mottus (California Brain Tumor Association), Alea Solomon, and Desiree Jaworski (Center for Safer Wireless), and comments on this issue were also received by email from a number of remote viewers. Zainab Alkebsi read a comment from Blake Reed suggesting that the next DAC considering copyright issues around accessible captioning. Christian Vogler then offered the interoperability of the Internet of Things with telecommunication relay services as another topic for consideration at the next DAC.

The meeting was adjourned at approximately 3:30 PM.

Appendix A  
Recommendations for Issues to Consider in the 2017 Disability Advisory Committee  
December 6, 2016

**Communications Subcommittee:**

- Review laws and standards for real time text and wide band speech; encourage coordination with international standards.

**Video Programing Subcommittee**

- Separation of broadcast of Spanish translation and Audio Description
- Provision of usable and consistent metadata from captions

**Technology Transitions Subcommittee**

- Affordability of IP equipment and service
- Transition for captioners who still rely on copper; impact on caption quality and availability of captioners
- In-house call alerting systems compatibility with IP-based equipment
- Side tone

**Relay / Equipment Distribution Subcommittee:**

- Assistive and Augmentative Communications (AAC) best practices for people with speech disabilities.
- Continued focus on all TRS services quality improvements, ease of use, ease of accessibility and 911 improvements.
- Review of the MITRE COE issues to determine whether there are outstanding issues.
- Review the status of the platform approach (ACE) the FCC was researching and give guidance on how this impacts consumers positively or negatively.
- Review digital captioning implementation and enforcement and make recommendations in the area of enforcement, TV Broadcaster obligation education on what is required, and consumer education.
- Review set top box proposal the FCC is considering to determine impact on digital captioning.
- Further discussion and implementation variables on Real-Time Text transition.
- Review CVAA implementation and determine if any recommendations need to be made based on what has emerged thus far.
- Quality Standards/ Metrics for VRS including interpreter qualifications, video quality, skill-based routing, and Deaf interpreters
- 911 Rule changes for Web and Mobile IP CTS calling
- 911 Training for all forms of Relay to PSAPs
- 911 Call Routing
- Speech-to-Speech (STS) quality recommendations

Appendix B  
Disability Advisory Committee Members in Attendance  
December 6, 2016

<b>Last Name</b>	<b>First Name</b>	<b>Organization Represented</b>
Alkebsi	Zainab	National Association of the Deaf (NAD)
Bacon	Everette	National Federation of the Blind (NFB)
Bibler	Ron	Consumer
Brooks (alternate)	Marcia	Perkins School for the Blind
Burstein	Diane	National Cable & Telecommunications Association (NCTA)
Creagan	Tim	U.S. Access Board ( <i>ex officio</i> )
Dillner	Ian	Verizon
Fletcher	Marc	Avaya, Inc.
Fields	Sabrina	Telecommunications Equipment Distribution Program Association (TEDPA)
Gerst	Matthew	CTIA - the Wireless Association
Goldberg	Larry	Yahoo, Inc.
Hamlin	Lise	Hearing Loss Association of America
Joehl	Sam	SSB BART Group
Hunter	Jocelyn	Columbia Lighthouse for the Blind
Kearney	Julie	Consumer Technology Association (CTA)
Kelly Frye	Brenda	National Association of State Relay Administration
Mazrui	Susan	AT&T
Mitchell	Helena	Wireless Rehabilitation Engineering Research Center
Nygren	Maggie	American Association on Intellectual & Developmental Disability
Pila	Joshua	National Association of Broadcasters (NAB)
Reid	James	Telecommunications Industry Association
Richert	Mark	American Foundation for the Blind (AFB)
Sonnenstrahl	Al	Deaf Seniors of America
Stephens	Tony	American Council of the Blind
Stout	Claude	Telecommunications for the Deaf and Hard of Hearing, Inc. (TDI)
Taylor	Jamie	Deaf Blind Citizens in Action
Thompson	Hannah	Consumer
Tua-Tupuola	Tafa	Association of University Centers on Disability
Vogler	Christian	Gallaudet RERC
Yousuf	Mohammed	U. S. Department of Transportation, Federal Highway Administration
Yunashko	Bryen	Helen Keller National Center
Wlodkowski	Thomas	Comcast Cable

CGB Staff

Karen Peltz Strauss

Suzy Rosen Singleton

Rosaline Crawford

Eliot Greenwald

Elaine Gardner

Will Schell

Michael Scott